


“Customer banking rights awareness in Ghana”

AUTHORS	Emmanuel Carsamer
ARTICLE INFO	Emmanuel Carsamer (2018). Customer banking rights awareness in Ghana. <i>Banks and Bank Systems</i> , 13(2), 141-152. doi: 10.21511/bbs.13(2).2018.12
DOI	http://dx.doi.org/10.21511/bbs.13(2).2018.12
RELEASED ON	Monday, 02 July 2018
RECEIVED ON	Friday, 09 February 2018
ACCEPTED ON	Wednesday, 23 May 2018
LICENSE	 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License
JOURNAL	"Banks and Bank Systems"
ISSN PRINT	1816-7403
ISSN ONLINE	1991-7074
PUBLISHER	LLC “Consulting Publishing Company “Business Perspectives”
FOUNDER	LLC “Consulting Publishing Company “Business Perspectives”



NUMBER OF REFERENCES

47



NUMBER OF FIGURES

0



NUMBER OF TABLES

5

© The author(s) 2024. This publication is an open access article.



BUSINESS PERSPECTIVES



LLC "CPC "Business Perspectives"
Hryhorii Skovoroda lane, 10, Sumy,
40022, Ukraine

www.businessperspectives.org

Received on: 9th of February, 2018
Accepted on: 23rd of May, 2018

© Emmanuel Carsamer, 2018

Emmanuel Carsamer, Ph.D., Senior
Lecturer, Economics Education
Department, University of Education,
Ghana.



This is an Open Access article, distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution-Non-Commercial 4.0 International license](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/), which permits re-use, distribution, and reproduction, provided the materials aren't used for commercial purposes and the original work is properly cited.

Emmanuel Carsamer (Ghana)

CUSTOMER BANKING RIGHTS AWARENESS IN GHANA

Abstract

The purpose of this paper is to investigate the determinants of customer banking right awareness regarding banking products and services in Ghana. A survey of 569 bank customers was conducted in Metropolitan Assemblies in Ghana, using a structured questionnaire with Likert-type questions. Customers were conveniently intercepted as they walked out of universal banks. Ordered probit estimation technique was used to test the research hypotheses. The study revealed that whilst bank variables (duration and number of visits) improve customers' knowledge on bank products and services, demographic factors (age, marriage, income) enhance the level of awareness customers have with regards to bank products and services. The study also revealed that education reduces it in Ghana. Sources of information such as banking exhibitions and fairs, family and mass media improve customer banking right awareness, however, bank staff negatively affect awareness level. The study advises banks to pay particular attention to sources of information, especially bank staff, bank brochures, mass media, exhibitions and fairs. Also, age and income segment of customers should be considered when attempting to improve customer banking right awareness for satisfactory service delivery.

Keywords

customer right, right awareness, ordered probit, exhibitions, Ghana, universal bank

JEL Classification G21, D18

INTRODUCTION

Today, more than ever before, the ability to maximize customer loyalty is critical to the growth of retail banks (Amoako, 2012; Adu-Gyimafi, 2008). As banks strive to achieve sustainable growth, there has been a fundamental change in the way banks interact with their acquired and target customers. Traditionally, banks have grown through an aggressive strategy of acquiring customers and branch networks from their direct competitors. However, that strategy is no longer sufficient, since it does not create organic growth for the financial institution. To build stronger customer loyalty, banks need to improve customer awareness about products and services at specific market segments that have the ability to drive growth.

The banking industry in Ghana, including nonbanking financial institutions, has seen an astronomical growth over the past three decades (BoG, 2015). Whilst the financial sector is described as one of the fastest mutating sectors in Ghana (BoG, 2015; AGB, 2014), paradoxically, the process of banking service delivery is still very much less understood, largely because of considerable lacunae in customers' knowledge of their rights. However, scholars engaged in the study of retail banking (Christopher et al., 1991; Ako-Nai, 2011; Amoako, 2012; Ishak & Zabil, 2012) have provided some fascinating insights that help in characterizing banking, thus directing attention to low level of customer banking right awareness. When consumers know their rights and responsibilities, it ensures that only the most competitive businesses succeed. In this way, customers contribute to competition, growth and innovation in the industry.

Consumer awareness of rights and the certainty that these are observed make customers act confidently in the market. Also, consumers' awareness enhances businesses' incentives to comply with legislation and respect for customers. Customers' knowledge on and understanding of their rights help them to become more satisfied with financial services and make them to remain loyal to banks. Against this backdrop, this study explores the extent of customer banking rights, for not only to tease out the ambivalent discourses of banking, but also its transformative practices. In the absence of significant awareness regarding banks' products and services among customers, banks cannot achieve their objectives of broadening customer base. Thus, the analysis of the level of awareness will not only help to know the extent of awareness but will also inform stakeholders on significant policy implications with the view of improving the extent of awareness regarding banking products and services among customers. Besides, it will reduce the possibility of bank runs to prevent fire sales to help build confidence in the banking industry and the economy at large.

Attention to the customer right has become necessary because banking has become a "big business" in the Ghanaian economy (Adu-Gyimafi, 2008). At individual level, banking comes naturally in job markets experience because salaries are paid through accounts. Also, there is extensive use of banking metaphors in accessing loans, overdraft intents, and other banking services (Ako-Nai, 2011; Amaoko, 2012; Ishak & Zabil, 2012). Accordingly, this paper examines the extent of retail banking customers' level of awareness of products and services, and plausible factors explaining the right awareness of valued customers in Ghana.

Similar to this study are those analyzing bancassurance awareness among bank customers (Lymberopoulos et al., 2004; Rajkumari, 2007; Popli & Rao, 2009). These studies provide important versions from India and Greece. An attempt in the same direction in the banking industry has been to bridge the knowledge gap by providing evidence from Ghana where the growth of banks has been astronomical. Interestingly, these studies used non-parametric test of Chi-square and have observed low level of awareness. However, a study by Rajkumari (2007) on customer bancassurance awareness reveals a high level of awareness among Tele callers. The implication is that the level of awareness about bank products and services should improve to provide efficient banking services. While the aforementioned studies used non-parametric test to examine the antecedents and extent of awareness, the current study, though with the same objective, uses ordered probit (nonlinear regression) to spot the factors influencing the extent of awareness among the bank customers regarding products and services of banks. The level of awareness among banking customers is partial. The sources of information, demographic and bank factors are important factors of customer awareness. The remaining text of this paper is organized as follows: section 1 is a review of the relevant literature, and section 2 describes the methodology employed. Section 3 presents the analysis and discussion of the findings. Finally, the last section provides conclusions and policy implications.

1. LITERATURE

Possession of wrong information by economic agents about the potential consumers and sellers explains rights awareness deficiency in a particular contract (Evans & Wurster, 1999). Asymmetric information occurs whenever one party possesses greater material knowledge than the other party. Buyers' behavior is crucially dependent on the information that is made available to them before purchase of a product. In order to make more informed choices, buyers need to be aware of prod-

uct characteristics. This is difficult to evaluate due to intangibility and simultaneous production and consumption, especially service quality (Holmstrom, 1984) and this makes information costly (Stigler, 1961). Furthering issue, Akerlof (1970) observes that when there exist information asymmetries between buyers and sellers, high and low quality goods and services can coexist in the market place. This may characterize the Ghanaian banking industry since information disclosure to customers has not been perfect mainly because there has been consistent quarrel between bankers

and customers. Information disclosure to customers is limited by banks, such that banks undertake initiatives without customers' consent. Therefore, while customers engage in moral hazard, banks adversely select customers resulting in high loan default rate (Holmstrom, 1984).

The use of the word "bank" or "banker" is an inspiration from various Acts. For instance, the Bill of Exchange Act 1882, the Agricultural Credit Act 1928, and the Banking Act of 1979. These Acts say that a bank is any incorporated company carrying forward banking business which is approved by the Ministry of Finance and the supervision of such institutions is exercised by the Central bank (Clemes et al., 2010). According to the Banking Act 2004, and Act 673 section 11(1) in Ghana, institution that engages in acceptances of deposits and repays funds from the public; lending; financial leasing; investment in financial securities; money transmission services and issuing and administering means of payment (credit cards, travellers cheques and bankers' drafts) constitutes bank. Banking simply means financial intermediation. Banks are entities involved in deposit-taking primarily in the business of lending and the process of doing this is banking. Reinhart and Rogoff (2008) observe that bank and financial intermediary are used interchangeably and economic crises usually develop from financial intermediaries failures not necessarily, result from bank failures. Certainly, in many instances, banks are institutions that sponsor conduit activity and provide the needed liquidity and credit enhancements. Banking model of financial intermediation involves matching of the supply of and the demand for funds that occurs along an extended credit intermediation chain, with specialized markets and other institutions playing a part along the way (Pozsar et al., 2010). Shadow banking system decomposes the process of deposit-funded, hold-to-maturity lending conducted by banks into a more complex, wholesale-funded, securitization-based lending. Clearly this study defines bank as a business organization formed with the aim of dealing in money and credits, thereby earning interest for its shareholders.

People who use banks are called "customers". A person becomes a customer of a bank when s/he goes to the bank with money or checks and asks

to have account opened in his/her name. Simply put, bank customers are depositors, who entrust their money, facilities for storage and investment for which they receive interest on those who need temporary storage, some additional money is paid as commission, and change currency (Dimitri, 2012; Pirvu & Bochimnea, 2014).

Consumer awareness is traced to the US President John F. Kennedy when he made an actual declaration that consumer right is necessary. Awareness means understanding and knowledge about anything (personality, place, product or service). Consumer is aware when he being informed about the products and services, and ethical conduct for those responsible for the production and distribution of the goods. It can be the blending of analysis and intuition that may enhance the awareness. Awareness may be enhanced through a blend of analysis and intuition.

In general, rights of customers in relation to banking activities are mainly limited to a particular country's laws. In Ghana, customers have the right to request for reasonable information and explanation relating to an existing or intended products and services in terms of basic features of the products offered. In an implied situation, the standard agreement is for the bank to make information accessible in any means available to the customers at the bank's branches (Rawani & Gupta, 2002). The customer has the right to receive the general business terms and conditions and any changes that may happen. For instance, the right to be informed about the price of a product, fees and commission charges and the rate at which they are changed are issues the customer must be aware of.

In the competitive banking industry nowadays, many financial service providers tend to retain customers through strong marketing relationship strategies that differentiate products and services, in order to keep customers satisfy and loyal (Evans, 2002) to their institutions. Relationship marketing depends on trust (Ndubisi, 2004), commitment (Ndubisi, 2004) and communication (Morgan & Hunt, 1994) to improve customer knowledge of service, and understand customer needs clearer (Moorman, Deshpande, & Zaltman, 1993; Ndubisi, 2003; Jayasubramanian & Vaideke, 2012; MuktaDir, 2013). World Bank financial consumer protection

rules for customers are to ensure that consumers receive appropriate information to allow them to make informed decisions in finance (Campbell et al., 2011). It is stated that complementary financial literacy initiatives by banks directed to consumers increase knowledge of using financial products and services (Rutledge, 2010; Singh, Singh, & Sandhu, 2017). Consumer education, management scholars, media platforms, and intensive communication enhance consumer rights awareness (Kulkarni & Mehta, 2013; Sahabi et al., 2015). Detail and strengthening these factors increase general public awareness of consumer rights and consumer protection. In the absence of strong financial consumer awareness and protection, the growth-enhancing benefits of expanded financial inclusion may be severely undermined.

2. METHODS

2.1. Design

The article is an embedded case study design intended to provide in-depth understanding of rights awareness confronting Ghanaian banking customers in the utilization of retail banks' products and services. The aim was to examine the level of awareness of banking rights of consumers of banking products and services. To produce findings derived from real world settings, where the phenomena of interest unfold naturally, quantitative case study approach was used to examine antecedents in nonlinear regression through a series of pre-determined steps that could be studied since rights of customers are predominantly specified in law.

2.2. Study areas

The study was conducted in selected cities in Ghana. These cities were Takoradi (Takoradi Metropolitan Assemblies in the Western Region), Koforidua (New Juaben Municipality in the Eastern region), Adabraka-Accra (Kole Clotey Metropolis in Greater Accra region), and Adum-Kumasi (Kumasi Metropolis in the Ashanti Region). The choice of the entirely urban communities was informed by the urban oriented banking in Ghana. Banks are highly concentrated in urban centers where business activities are flam-

boyant and juicy because of the long standing convention that banking is an urban commodity. Again, in almost all socio-economic indices, rural Ghana compares unfavorably with urban Ghana in terms of banking products consumption.

2.3. Sampling and data

Six hundred and fifty-nine (659) participants were involved in the study. Respondents included SME owners, teachers, pastors, politicians, students, nurses among others. The study is a cross-sectional survey because data was collected with the help of structured questionnaire. A multistage sampling technique was adopted. In the first phase, Purposive Sampling was used to select Metropolis. In the second stage, Quota Sampling was used to assign quota to each metropolis and the Convenience Sampling Method was used to select the respondents for the study. The convenience sampling technique was used because it was difficult to get sample frame of bank customers and since customers of a bank had almost equal characteristics, makes this technique to assure each customer equal chance of being selected. Data were collected between November and December 2016 at the banking hall gates since the interest was more on institutional representations and users' perspectives only. Table 1 shows the bio-data of respondents.

It can be observed from descriptive statistics in Table 1 that the mean age of respondents was about 35 years and this is indicative of youthful respondents. It also suggests that the respondents may have long periods of banking experience. The data showed that 62% of respondents are married and 63 percent have children. This is also suggestive of the fact that the respondents are highly responsible because in Ghana being married and having children is a sign of responsiveness. In terms of education, 67.5 percent have tertiary level of education, 21 percent have SHS and 11.5 percent have basic education. The high level of education could be attributed to the access and increasing number of tertiary institutions such as Distance and E-learning centers in Ghana. About 76 percent of the respondents had accounts with two or three banks, 6 percent had accounts with four banks, and 13 percent had accounts with one bank. This shows

Table 1. Descriptive statistics of variables in the model

Variable	Obs	Mean	SD	Kurtosis	Skewness
Dependent variable					
Not aware at all	659	0.099	0.298	8.248	2.692
Partially aware	659	0.341	0.475	1.447	0.669
Significantly aware	659	0.333	0.472	1.497	0.704
Completely aware	659	0.226	0.418	2.715	1.309
Awareness	659	2.687	0.93	0.8976	1.324
Demographic variable					
Age1 (<25Yrs)	659	1.476	0.499	1.009	0.094
Age2 (25–35Yrs)	659	2.801	0.821	2.395	–0.178
Age3 (35+Yrs)	659	2.712	0.632	5.412	–1.987
Male	659	2.757	0.893	4.163	1.313
Female	659	2.382	0.951	1.902	–0.255
Married	659	1.476	0.499	1.009	0.094
Single	659	2.801	0.821	2.395	–0.178
Y1 (0-1,500)	659	2.712	0.632	5.412	–1.987
Y2 (1,500-2,500)	659	3.551	1.017	1.813	0.352
Y3 (2,500+)	659	2.974	1.459	1.737	0.039
JHS	659	3.013	1.041	1.584	0.159
SHS	659	3.475	1.09	3.264	–1.189
Tertiary	659	2.712	0.632	5.412	–1.987
Bank variables					
Duration	659	2.677	0.614	2.341	0.328
Type of account	659	2.757	0.893	4.163	1.313
Number of accounts	659	2.712	0.632	5.412	–1.987
Number of visits per month	659	2.602	0.489	1.175	–0.419
Source of information					
Staff	659	3.505	1.038	1.833	0.231
Mass media	659	2.974	1.459	1.737	0.039
Bank brochures	659	3.013	1.041	1.584	0.159
Sign and bill boards	659	3.475	1.09	3.264	–1.189
Family	659	3.232	1.208	2.221	0.082
Exhibitions and fairs	659	2.974	0.931	3.022	0.661

that about 84 percent of the respondents were engaged in split banking. As per the household income, 81 percent of respondents had average income of about one thousand four hundred Ghana cedis (GHS 1,400) per month and this means that socio-economic status of respondents is comparatively high. The dependent variable which measures the extent of banking rights awareness, shows that fifty-two percent of the respondents were partially aware of their banking rights, twenty-one percent were significantly aware of their banking rights, eighteen percent of respondents were not aware of their banking rights and only nine percent of respondents were completely aware of their banking rights indicating that bank customers have low level of right awareness in Ghana.

3. MODEL SPECIFICATION

The Ordered Probit Model, which is a limited dependent variable model, was used to predict the extent of awareness defined as polychotomous. The Ordered Probit Model was employed for the study since it is categorical, easier to interpret and parsimonious in the number of parameters estimated (Zhang et al., 2014). The dependent variable is categorized as 0, 1, 2 and 3 corresponding to “not aware about customer banking rights”, “partially aware about customer banking rights”, “significantly aware about customer banking rights” and “completely aware about customer banking rights”. The initial model is defined as follows:

$$y_i^* = \beta' x_i + \varepsilon_i, \quad (1)$$

where y_i^* is an unobserved latent variable measuring the level of awareness; β represents a row vector of parameters to be estimated; x_i is a column vector of explanatory variables; and ε_i is a random error term which is assumed to follow a standard normal distribution. The observed y is obtained by using y_i^* which is also expressed as:

$$y_i = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} 0; \text{ if not aware about banking right} \\ 1; \text{ if partially aware about banking right} \\ 2; \text{ if significantly aware about banking right} \\ 3; \text{ if completely aware about banking right} \end{array} \right\}, \quad (2)$$

where $\pi_i (i = 1, 2, 3)$ denotes thresholds that are estimated along with the parameter vector β . Then, the likelihood function may be written as:

$$L(\beta, \pi_0, \pi_1, \pi_2) = P(y_0 = 0) \cdot P(y_1 = 1) \times P(y_2 = 2) \cdot P(y_3 = 3) \quad (3)$$

and the cumulative distribution function, which is defined as:

$$(\pi_0 - \beta' X) = \int_{-\infty}^{\pi_0 - \beta' X} \frac{e^{(\pi_0 - \beta' X)}}{(1 + e^{\pi_0 - \beta' X})^2} \cdot d(\pi_0 - \beta' X) \quad (4)$$

forms the basis of the empirical model.

4. EMPIRICAL RESULTS

Data were validated, before Ordered Probit Modelling was conducted to test the hypotheses. Statistical tests of normality, convergent validity, discriminant validity, multicollinearity and Common Method Bias (CMB) were used for the validation.

Table 2. Internal consistency of structures

Construct	Number of items	Item total correlation	Weighted mean	Cronbach's alpha
Factor 1/service failure	7		3.123	0.784
Bank does not keep accurate records		0.612		
Bank makes mistake on my account		0.589		
Bank does not meet all my banking needs		0.653		
Staff are not competent and knowledgeable		0.546		
Staff appeared rude and snobbish		0.743		
Staff are unsympathetic and unwilling to help		0.622		
Staff were slow in delivery services		0.564		
Factor 2/number of accounts	2		3.065	0.854

5. EXPLORATORY FACTOR ANALYSIS

In order to identify the main dimensions of the variables that are important in explaining customer bank right awareness, the variables were factor analyzed using sphericity and Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin tests (Pallant, 2013; Meyers et al., 2013). The Bartlett test of sphericity (χ^2 : 6541.743, df: 596, sig.: 0.003) and the Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin (KMO) test of sample adequacy index value of 0.736 confirm the appropriateness of the data for exploratory factor analysis. The internal reliability of the factors was confirmed by Cronbach's coefficient test with strict attention on the minimum value of 0.6 (Meyers et al., 2013). Factors with reliability coefficients greater or equal to 0.60 were included in the discussion (Sekaran, 2003; Meyers et al., 2013). Also, item-to total correlation was set above 0.3 (Parasuraman et al., 1988; Pallant, 2013), therefore, some factors were re-specified, especially those with only one item were added to other factors based on conceptual fitness (Hair et al., 1998) and retained if only it improves Cronbach's coefficient alpha value (Parasuraman et al., 1988). The results are presented in Table 2.

Factors which did not pass reliability of Cronbach's test of 0.6 were deleted or combined with others due to conceptual correspondence. The addition of one item factor resulted in higher Cronbach's alpha of 0.8. In all, only 9 out of the original fourteen factors were maintained.

Table 3 reports the probability distribution of the respondents belonging to each category of the dependent variable. The report shows that consumers of bank products and services are like-

Table 2 (cont.). Internal consistency of structures

Construct	Number of items	Item total correlation	Weighted mean	Cronbach's alpha
I have different accounts with other banks		0.654		
I have multiple accounts with my banks		0.55		
Factor 3/number of bank visits	3		3.432	0.789
I go to bank once every month		0.652		
I take bank statement regularly		0.533		
I check account status regularly		0.563		
Factor 4/duration				
I have banked with my bank for many years		0.584		
I bank with national banks only		0.456		
My bank is old		0.466		
Factor 5/pricing	7		3.621	0.765
Account status is changed by bank officers		0.657		
Difficult to use counter checks		0.516		
Interest rates on loans were very high		0.603		
Service charges were too high		0.453		
Service charges were changed frequently		0.604		
Loan processing was too expensive		0.613		
Minimum deposit was too high		0.571		
Factor 6/mediation	3		3.213	0.783
Bank does not resolve conflicts		0.633		
Bank was slow in resolving complaints		0.504		
Bank does not resolve complaints satisfactorily		0.55		
Factor 7/mass media	6		3.67	0.833
Mass media show case my bank		0.652		
Social media is used to explain banking		0.621		
Products and services		0.634		
Social media is used to explain fee charge		0.65		
Daily newspapers are used by my bank		0.64		
Post office mail sends information about banks		0.651		
Television advertises my bank products		0.57		
Factor 8/Family/relatives	4		3.544	0.762
Family members testify satisfaction of the bank		0.635		
Relatives explained charges to me		0.641		
Relatives introduce the bank to me		0.641		
Relatives have account with the bank		0.607		
Factor 9/bank brochures	5		3.052	0.745
Bank brochures are on the counter at the hall		0.654		
Banks explain brochures		0.562		
Banks distribute brochures		0.653		
Bank brochures are summary of products		0.632		
Bank brochures are self-explanatory		0.639		
Factor 5/trade fairs	4		3.514	0.706
Trade fairs are go time for banks		0.632		
Trade fairs are good for banks		0.652		
Marketers at fairs are good		0.564		
Trade fairs help banks to show case products		0.605		
Factor 5/extent of awareness	6		3.201	0.761
Banks send statement quarterly		0.641		
Banks inform customers before charges are changed		0.623		
I fought with bank officer before		0.625		
Banks have redressed procedures		0.63		
Challenge bank before		0.606		
Witness fight in banking hall before		0.652		

ly to be partially aware followed by significantly aware and the last not being aware of banking rights. Customers of banks in Ghana appear to have partial knowledge of their banking rights. The low probability of not being aware is in order since each customer at least has some level of right awareness such as unlawful deductions.

Table 3. Probability distribution of the categories of awareness extent

Source: Author's calculation.

Category	Definition	Probability
P(Y = 0)	Not aware	0.132
P(Y = 1)	Partially aware	0.432
P(Y = 2)	Significantly aware	0.342
P(Y = 3)	Completely aware	0.143

Table 4 presents results of the ordered probit model on the determinants of level of awareness of bank customers. The goodness-of-fit test shows that the model fits the data and Pearson deviance chi-square statistic ($\chi^2_{(8)} = 46.38 [0.864]$) is insignificant implying that the model adequately describes the data. Overall, Table 4 shows that the null hypothesis that the use of Plum is appropri-

ate is accepted as indicated by the insignificance of the Test of Parallel Lines. Determinants that were selected based on the literature are demographic variables (income, education, marital status, age, gender), bank variables (number of years one has been with the bank – duration, type of accounts, and number of customer visits) and source of information (bank staff, brochures, sign and bill boards, family/relatives, mass media and exhibitions and fairs) variables. Table 4 shows the relation between banking rights awareness, demographic, bank and source of information variables as a whole are important in explaining extent of awareness.

The explanation of the point estimate of the Ordered Probit results is based on the signs and significance of the parameter estimates. The results indicate that compared to being single, being married is significant and directly related to extent of awareness. Also age (1) and income level of banking customers are positively related to customer banking right awareness. These demographic factors are also significant at 10% level. While gender (male) is directly related to

Table 4. Point estimates of the parameters of ordered probit model

Independent variable	Dependent variable		
	Coefficient	SE	Z-statistics
Demographic variables			
Age1	0.021	0.011	1.85*
Age2	0.073	0.057	1.28
Male	-0.004	0.062	0.65
Married	0.0172	0.0057	3.021***
SHS	0.107	0.058	1.84*
Tertiary	0.232	0.115	2.02**
Income1	0.0156*	0.0081	1.93*
Income3	0.0193**	0.008	2.413***
Bank variables			
Duration	0.098	0.049	2.00**
Number of accounts	0.079	0.042	1.88*
Number of visits	0.021	0.035	0.601
Type of account	-0.011	0.095	0.12
Source of information			
Staff	-0.188	0.107	1.75*
Family members	0.106	0.099	1.07
Bills and sign boards	-0.049	0.098	0.55
Mass media	0.185	0.099	1.87*
Bank brochures	0.200	0.102	1.96**
Exhibitions and fairs	0.169	0.89	1.94*

Note: ***, ** and * denote significance levels at 1%, 5% and 10%, respectively.

customer banking right awareness, education (SHS) is negative. However, both variables are insignificant.

For the bank level variables, the number of years a respondent has spent with a bank increases the extent of awareness. While type of account reduces the extent of awareness, number of accounts and number of bank visit, in a month increase with the extent of customer banking right awareness. Source of information, the main channel through which bank customers get information on bank products and services is paramount. Mass media, family members, bank brochures and exhibitions and fairs are directly related to the extent of customer banking right awareness but inversely related to it are staff, bills and sign boards. With these sources of information, mass media, staff, exhibitions and fairs and families are significant in explaining extent of banking right awareness in Ghana. Similarly, in line with Rajkumari (2007) and Kulkarni and Mehta (2013), bank staff have a detrimental impact on the extent of awareness. Consistent with the existing literature, level of education is negatively related to overall awareness, that is, people with higher level of education are associated with lower levels of overall awareness but it contrasts to Vijayakumar and Venugopal (2012). This could mean that educated elite are reluctant to ask questions in the banking hall. According to Kulkarni and Mehta (2013), the natural logarithm of household medium income exerts a positive and statistically significant impact on overall awareness but it decreases with high income level. This suggests a diminishing marginal utility of income. The variable, which captures demographic factors relating to the extent of awareness position, has the expected impact on the level of overall awareness. This supports Ndubisi (2004), that the education and income were significant determinants of overall banking rights awareness.

Focusing on the source of information variables included in the model, Table 4 revealed that, in line with prior expectations from Sahabi et al. (2015) and Jayasubramanian and Vaideke (2012), higher levels of mass media, bank exhibitions and fairs are associated with higher levels of awareness, but the specifications indicate that bank staff and brochures are associated with lower levels of awareness. The surprising negative relationship

between bank staff and extent of awareness may be explained by the service profit chain theory that states that highly motivated and satisfied employees interact with customers and create superior opportunity to explain summarized information in bank brochures to customers (Heskett et al., 2015). The results developed the findings of Popli and Rao (2009) and Lymberopoulos et al. (2004) by showing that their results are not unique to Greece and India alone. Similarly, the results show that the source of information is an important determinant of overall customer satisfaction, in addition to the demographic factors. This potentially reflects the subjective right awareness position of Ghanaian banking customers as it captures information beyond that contained in the banking industry. The results highlight the importance of controlling staff behavior and providing detailed information on brochures beyond advertisement of products and services. When this is done, the relationship between customer satisfaction and loyalty service will improve, thereby enhancing relationship marketing.

To have full view of the impact elasticity of the demographic, bank and source of information variables, the analysis of marginal effect is important. The marginal effect coefficients of the Ordered Probit estimates based on post estimation methods are presented in Table 5. One significant observation was that some of the variables changed signs and some significant variables became insignificant. The results show that married customers banking rights awareness increases by 2.5%, 2.6%, 3.3% and 1.5% for no awareness, partial awareness, significant awareness and complete awareness, respectively. The probability of old people being aware increases by 4.9%, 7.6%, 5.1% and 4.4% for no partial, significant and complete awareness, respectively. One major observation is that most customers have high probability of being partially aware of their banking rights. A one cedi increase in income of a customer increases significantly the probability of being partially aware and completely aware by 6.6% and 4.4%, respectively. The marginal effect of long relationship of a customer with a bank has probability of 1.7%, 1.9%, and 1.6% probability of being partial, significant and completely aware of their banking rights with exception of not aware. Exhibitions and fairs increase the probability of a bank customer being partially aware

Table 5. Marginal effects of factors affecting the extent of awareness regarding bank products and liaise services

Independent variable	Dependent variable			
	Probability of no awareness	Probability of partial awareness	Probability of significant awareness	Probability of complete awareness
Demographic variables				
Age1	0.0204(0.0259)	0.0331(0.0211)	0.0827(0.0515)	0.0868*(0.0474)
Age2	0.075**(0.002)	0.014***(0.000)	0.025*(0.064)	0.054*(0.053)
Female	0.0681**(0.0297)	0.0725*(0.0408)	0.0938(0.0162)	0.0808***(0.0196)
SHS	0.049*(0.073)	0.076*(0.067)	0.051*(0.057)	0.044*(0.066)
Tertiary	0.047*(0.050)	0.030*(0.057)	0.028*(0.053)	0.049*(0.050)
Married	0.0075***(0.0027)	0.0069**(0.0032)	0.0078(0.0048)	0.0026(0.0936)
Income1	0.025*(0.064)	0.026*(0.064)	0.033*(0.017)	0.015*(0.069)
Income3	-0.66**(0.005)	0.022*(0.001)	0.0350*(0.087)	0.044**(0.007)
Bank variables				
Duration	-0.014***(0.000)	0.019*(0.021)	0.047**(0.001)	0.016*(0.072)
Number of accounts	0.226***(0.000)	0.145***(0.001)	0.172**(0.001)	0.66**(0.005)
Number of visits	0.009(0.228)	0.008(0.447)	0.009(0.722)	0.007(0.616)
Type of account	0.002(0.615)	-0.002(0.438)	0.008(0.303)	0.002(0.090)
Source of information				
Staff	0.012(0.270)	-0.010(0.256)	0.019(0.447)	0.017(0.200)
Family	0.051*(0.057)	0.034*(0.046)	0.016*(0.072)	0.032*(0.062)
Bills and sign boards	0.009(0.219)	0.003(0.703)	0.003(0.909)	0.002(0.090)
Mass media	0.027*(0.048)	0.026*(0.068)	0.044*(0.066)	0.045*(0.058)
Bank brochures	0.005(0.571)	0.003(0.558)	0.007(0.712)	0.005(0.823)
Exhibitions and fairs	0.044**(0.007)	-0.042**(0.007)	0.029*(0.026)	0.045*(0.058)
Diagnostic tests				
PD Chi square	46.38(0.864)			
Parallel lines	42.76(0.543)			

Note: *, ** and *** denote significance levels at 10%, 5% and 1%, respectively. P-values are in parentheses.

and completely aware by 4.5 and 4.5 percentage points. Mass media has the probability of 4.42% of being reducing partial awareness but increases by 2.9 percentage point of being significantly aware.

The probability of bank customer not being aware, partially aware, significantly aware and completely aware increases by 5.1, 3.4 and 3.2 percentage points as they with family members.

CONCLUSION AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS

The purpose of the study was to analyze the extent of awareness regarding bank products and services among customers of Ghanaian banks. Six hundred and fifty-nine (659) customers of universal banks were used to examine the factors affecting the extent of awareness among bank customers. Given that the dependent variable: the extent of awareness is polychotomous variable, the Ordered Probit Model was employed for the analysis. The analysis of the dependent variable (extent of awareness) revealed that partial awareness is highest followed by significant awareness, not aware, and completely aware about bank products and services in Ghana respectively. The Ordered Probit Model showed that the bank variables (duration and number of visits) positively and significantly affect the extent of awareness regarding bank products and services. Among sources of information, banking exhibitions and fairs, family members and mass media contribute significantly and positively in increasing extent of awareness regarding bank products and services. Sources of information such as staff and bank brochures negatively affect the probability of complete awareness, however, they were found to be positively affecting partial

awareness. For the demographic factors, income of the customers significantly enhances the extent of awareness regarding bank products and services, but education reduces the extent of awareness regarding bank products and services among bank customers. Thus, the hypothesis of insignificant effect of the extent of awareness regarding the source of information of banks on products and services has been rejected in weak form.

The analysis revealed that the extent of awareness regarding banking products and services among the customers of the Ghanaian banks is partial. Therefore, management of banks needs to improve the level of awareness regarding their products and services among their customers. This points to the long distance to be covered by banks if they are to enhance the awareness level so as to maintain customer loyalty. In the light of this, motivating bank staff, and increasing the frequency of dealing with relatives and mass media may prove crucial. Further, studies can consider why the traditional sources of information, namely bank brochures and bank staff, are failing to spread complete information regarding bank products and services among bank customers. Given these, banks need to speed up policies and staff information dissemination to customers to help them have fair, timely, detailed and relevant knowledge on products and services of banks.

REFERENCES

- Adu-Gyamfi, K. (2008). *The Culture of Poor Customer Service in Ghana. The Way Forward*. Retrieved from <http://ghana-consciousness.ghanathink.org/blogs/gap/2008/01/culture-poor-customer-service-ghana-way-forward>
- AGB (2014). Standard terms of contract (Allgemeine Geschäftsbedingungen or AGBs).
- Agricultural Credit Act (1928). Retrieved from <http://www.irish-statutebook.ie/eli/1928/act/22/enacted/en/print.html>
- Akerlof, G. A. (1970). The market for "lemons": Quality uncertainty and the market mechanism. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 84(3), 488-500. Retrieved from https://www.jstor.org/stable/1879431?seq=1#page_scan_tab_contents
- Ako-Nai, C. (2011). *Customer Relationship Management as a Competitive Tool in the Ghanaian Banking Industry: a Case Study of Zenith bank Ghana LTD Kumasi*. (Dissertation, Institute of Distance Learning Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology). Retrieved from <https://ru.scribd.com/document/219645783/thesis>
- Amoako, G. K. (2012). Improving customer service in the banking industry-case of Ghana Commercial Bank (GCB) – Ghana. *International Business Research*, 5(4), 134.
- Bank of Ghana (1983). *Quarterly Bulletin*. Retrieved from <https://www.bog.gov.gh/statistics/publication/quarterly-bulletin>
- Bank of Ghana (2004). *Statistical Bulletin*. Retrieved from <https://www.bog.gov.gh/statistics/statistical-bulletin>
- Bank of Ghana (2015). *Annual Report*. Retrieved from https://www.bog.gov.gh/privatecontent/Publications/Annual_Reports/2015_Annual_report.pdf
- Banking Act (1979). Retrieved from <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/1979/37/contents>
- Bills of Exchange Act (1882). Retrieved from <http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/Vict/45-46/61>
- Campbell, J. Y., Jackson, H. E., Madrian, B. C., & Tufano, P. (2011). Consumer financial protection. *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 25(1), 91-114.
- Christopher, M., Payne, A., & Ballantyne, D. (1991). *Relationship Marketing: Bringing Quality, Customer Service and Marketing Together*. London: Butterworth-Heinemann.
- Clemes, M. D., Gan, C., & Dongmei, Z. (2010). Customer switching behavior in the Chinese retail banking industry. *International Journal of Bank Marketing*, 28(7), 519-546.
- Dimitriu, D. S. (2012). Customers' Categories and Types of Banking Services. *Annals of the University of Petrosani, Economics*, 12(2), 127-134. Retrieved from <https://www.upet.ro/annals/economics/pdf/2012/part2/Dimitriu.pdf>
- Evans, M. (2002). Prevention is better than cure: redoubling the focus on customer retention. *Journal of Financial Services Marketing*, 7(2), 186-198.
- Evans, P., & Wurster, T. S. (1999). Getting real about virtual commerce. *Harvard Business Review*, 77, 84-98.
- Hinson, R. (2004). The Importance of Service Quality in Ghana Banking Sector. *The Marketing Challenge*, 7(3), 16-18.
- Hinson, R., Mohammed, A., & Mensah, R. (2006). Determinants of Ghanaian Bank Service Quality in a Universal Banking Dispensation. *Banks and Bank Systems*, 1(2), 69-81. Retrieved from https://businessperspectives.org/images/pdf/applications/publishing/templates/article/assets/1548/BBS_en_2006_02_Hinson.pdf

20. Holmstrom, B. (1984). *The Provision of Service in a Market Economy* (Fisherman-Davidson Center Discussion Paper). Philadelphia: Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania.
21. Ishak, S., & Zabil, N. F. M. (2012). Impact of consumer awareness and knowledge to consumer effective behavior. *Asian Social Science*, 8(13), 108-114. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/ass.v8n13p108>
22. Jaruwachirathanakul, B., & Fink, D. (2005). Internet banking adoption strategies for a developing country: the case of Thailand. *Internet Research*, 15(3), 295-311.
23. Jayasubramanian, P., & Vaideke, A. (2012). A Study on Consumer Awareness and Attitude towards Consumer Protection Measures. *Indian Journal of Applied Research*, 1(12), 29-31.
24. Kulkarni, M. S., & Mehta, M. B. (2013). Buying Practices and Consumer Rights Awareness Amongst Management Students. *MERC Global's International Journal of Management*, 1(1), 78-85. Retrieved from https://mpra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/48769/1/MPRA_paper_48769.pdf
25. Lymberopoulos, K., Chaniotakis, I., & Soureli, M. (2004). Opportunities for Banks to Cross-Sell Insurance Products in Greece. *Journal of Financial Services*, 9(1), 34-48.
26. Meyers, L. S., Gamst, G. C., & Guarino, A. J. (2013). *Performing data analysis using IBM SPSS*. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons. Retrieved from https://books.google.com.ua/books/about/Performing_Data_Analysis_Using_IBM_SPSS.html?id=SQgeAAAAQBAJ&redir_esc=y
27. Moorman, C., Deshpande, R., & Zaltman, G. (1993). Factors affecting trust in market research relationships. *The Journal of Marketing*, 57, 81-101.
28. Morgan, R., & Hunt, S. (1994). The commitment-trust theory of relationship marketing. *Journal of Marketing*, 58(3), 20-45.
29. Mutkadir, K. A. (2013). Financial Inclusion, Customer Awareness and Protection. The 4th Conference on Financial Services and Consumers. Karachi.
30. Ndubisi, N. (2004). Service quality: understanding customer perception and reaction, and its impact on business. *International Journal of Business*, 207-219.
31. Pallant, J. (2013). *SPSS Survival Manual*. UK: McGraw-Hill Education.
32. Parasuraman, A., & Grewal, D. (2000). The impact of technology on the quality-value-loyalty chain: a research agenda. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 28(1), 168-174.
33. Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V. A., & Berry, L. L. (1988). SERVQUAL: a multiple-item scale for measuring consumer perceptions of service quality. *Journal of Retailing*, 64(1), 12-40.
34. Pirvu, A. I., & Boghirnea, I. (2014). Issues Related to Personal Data Protection in the Banking System. *Supplement*, 144.
35. Popli, G. S., & Rao, D. N. (2009). An Empirical Study of Bancassurance: Prospects & Challenges for Selling Insurance Products through Banks in India. *SSRN Electronic Journal*. <https://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.1339471>
36. Pozsar, Z., Adrian, T., Ashcraft, A., & Boesky, H. (2010). Shadow banking. *Federal Reserve Bank of New York Staff Reports*, 458.
37. Rajkumari, M. (2007). A Study on Customer Preference towards Insurance Services and Bancassurance. *The ICAFI Journal of Risk and Insurance*, 4(4), 49-60. Retrieved from <https://ru.scribd.com/doc/105464354/Study-on-Consumer-Preference-Towards-Insurance-Services-and-Bancassurance>
38. Rawani, M. A., & Gupta, P. M. (2002). Role of Information Systems in Bank: An Empirical Study in Indian Context. *Vikalpa*, 27(4), 69-74.
39. Reinhart, C. M., & Rogoff, K. S. (2008). *This time is different: A panoramic view of eight centuries of financial crises* (NBER Working paper, No. 13882). Cambridge: National Bureau of Economic Research. Retrieved from <http://www.nber.org/papers/w13882.pdf>
40. Rutledge, S. L. (2010). *Consumer protection and financial literacy: lessons from nine country studies* (Policy Research working paper, No. WPS5326). Washington, DC: World Bank. <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/676251468233092150/Consumer-protection-and-financial-literacy-lessons-from-nine-country-studies>
41. Sahabi, J., Aghbeigpoori, H., Razaei, M., & Mohammadpur, A. (2015). A Study on Level of Awareness of Civil Rights and Duties and its Effective Factors in Sanandaj. *Merit Research Journal of Arts, Social Science and Humanities*, 3(2), 18-26. Retrieved from <http://meritresearchjournals.org/assh/Content/2015/February/Sahabi%20et%20al.pdf>
42. Sekaran, U. (2003). *Research methods for business* (4th ed.). Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons.
43. Singh, D., Singh, H., & Sandhu, N. (2017). Service Development Strategies Employed by Public and Private Sector Banks in India: A Comparative Study. *IUP Journal of Business Strategy*, 14(1), 18-33.
44. Stigler, G. J. (1961). The economics of information. *Journal of Political Economy*, 69(3), 213-225.
45. Szwarc, P. (2005). *Researching Customer Satisfaction and Loyalty: How to Find Out what People Really Think*. London: Kogan Page Publishers.
46. Vijayakumar, P., & Venugopal, P. (2012). Consumer Awareness and the Role of Educational Institutions. *A Journal of Radix International Educational and Research Consortium*, 1(5).
47. Zhang, S. S., van Doorn, J., & Leeflang, P. S. (2014). Does the importance of value, brand and relationship equity for customer loyalty differ between Eastern and Western cultures? *International Business Review*, 23(1), 284-292.